

Goodliff's book belies the importance of the topic. Goodliff's study certainly does not exhaust the issues, resources, or possibilities the topic has to offer, but it is a welcome place to begin.

TONY COSTA, *WORSHIP AND THE RISEN JESUS IN THE PAULINE LETTERS*. STUDIES IN BIBLICAL LITERATURE 157. NEW YORK: PETER LANG, 2013. (XV + 501PP.) [ISBN 978-1-4331-2290-3; ebook 978-1-4539-1154-9].

SARAH HARRIS

CAREY BAPTIST COLLEGE

Any reader of Paul knows how central matters pertaining to worship are in Pauline letters, and so it was surprising to note that Costa's book on this topic is breaking new ground. The heart of his book though is not simply "worship" but an engagement with the historical debate around how the risen Jesus was worshipped in the Pauline communities. The challenges and rigor required within this field of historical Jesus research is met with Costa's tome which boasts an equal quantity of endnotes to main text.

After a review of the work of Cullmann, Moule, Delling, Martin, F. Hahn, and Aune around the topic of worship, Costa engages with three contemporary scholars, Hutrado, Neyrey, and Bauckham. Their work in the field of the earliest Christian worship and the way this writer explores further evidence for worship of the risen Jesus from the Pauline letters is what makes this book a valuable addition to the ongoing research field.

One of Costa's critiques of earlier scholarship on worship is the lack of a definition with criteria that can be used for assessment, and so he provides a fully worked definition before he turns to analyse any text. He rightly identifies that this goes beyond certain Greek words into personal relationship and action and so considering expressions and acts which describe worship opens up further breadth (and I would add satisfaction) to his study. There is attention paid to the object of worship and notes that this context must be religious and so it goes beyond the Graeco—Roman honour culture where rank and status determine one's level of submission. Worship is only rendered to a deity and for a Christian it is to God to whom nothing can be added as he is complete. Similarly, Costa addresses the subject of worship, the worshipper who stands in total dependence upon God in a relationship such as a servant—master or child—parent. One is inferior and the other superior and it is total submission which makes it stand apart from other relationships where submission is partial and relative.

There is a full description of Pauline vocabulary of worship in a delightfully solid exegetical chapter where the range of words for what may be translated "worship" in English are explored. All occurrences and necessary cognates of *latreuō*, *sebazomai*, *proskuneō*, *douleuō* and *thrēskeia* as these pertain to a religious context are worked through systematically. My only question regarding his methodology in this section is his use at times of Thayer's lexicon which seems somewhat out—dated today, and for me, detracts from an otherwise well—resourced and argued chapter. There is further exegetical attention given to the

word *eidōlolatRIA* where a worship context is found. Clearly the problems of sacrificing to an idol intersect with daily life for Christians as food sacrificed was then consumed; with early Christian worship occurring around the meal table, idol worship is something Paul, as so Costa, needed to address.

An investigation into invocations and prayer is where Costa's monograph adds most fully to the ongoing historical Jesus conversation and becomes most interesting. He notes that there are times Paul appeals to not only God but to the risen Jesus with the context of Christian worship. He considers the invocations of Rom 10:9–14 and 1 Cor 1:2 where Jesus is specifically addressed but goes on to note Jesus as the referent of prayer in 1 Cor 16:22 and 2 Cor 10:8–10. This for Costa, and many others, attests to an early Christian acknowledgement of Jesus as the divine Lord. There is a full discussion of the significance of *maranatha* ("Come, O Lord," "Our Lord come," or "Our Lord has come") in 1 Cor 16:22, and its Aramaic background in original Judean soil. Under Costa's definition of worship where the context must be religious, and there be an addressee of divine order and a supplicant who is in total submission to the deity, he views their plea as worshippers Jesus as God. Further for Costa, Paul's appellation to the *Lord* with regard to his affliction in 2 Cor 10:8–10 is to Jesus and not God the Father as is his more standard phraseology (Rom 1:3–4; 10:9; 1 Cor 8:6; 12:3; 2 Cor 4:5; Phil 2:11). It is the *power of Christ* (a Pauline *hapex legomenon*), which Paul appeals to in prayer three times as the risen Jesus has the ability to remove the thorn in the flesh; it is the divine will of Jesus which he accepts when the thorn is not removed. Thus it is the power of Christ which rests on, or resides in Paul, and gives him reason to delight. In a Second Temple Jewish world where to pray to anyone but the one God is foreign, the earliest Christians seemed able to embrace Jesus as the Lord for he had risen from the grave, and thus, was to be worshipped. Costa also addresses wish prayers addressed to both God and the risen Jesus, hymns, spiritual songs, baptism and the Eucharist which were an integral part of the Christian community. He concludes with Wright that: "Baptism and eucharist thus both draw the eye upward to the most striking feature of life of the early [Christian] community; *the worship of Jesus*" (p. 230).¹

Finally, he addresses the *Zielangabe*, the ultimate purpose and goal of worship in Paul through an analysis of the *Carmen Christi* (Phil 2:6–11). The hymn begins and penultimately ends with Jesus while the final climax is God. God is not however the trump—card, rather as worship is rendered to the exalted Jesus, it is by extension given to God the Father. God is not replaced or rivaled, rather worship of Jesus, "*complements the worship of God and facilitates it*. The eschatological *grande finale* for Paul is the ultimate and universal glorification of God which God has purposed to be achieved through worship of the exalted Christ" (p. 249). This is a book well worth reading and reflecting on. I appreciate his close reading of the text and the voracity of his scholarship which leaves the reader well—satisfied.

¹ N. T. Wright, *The New Testament and the People of God* (London: SPCK, 1992), 448.