Scott MacDougall. *More Than Communion: Imagining an Eschatological Ecclesiology*. London: Bloomsbury T&T Clark, 2015. (viii + 290 pp.) ISBN: 9780567659880

Jordan L. Jones
Auckland, New Zealand

In *More Than Communion* Scott MacDougall engages in constructive criticism of ecclesiologies of communion. His title highlights his key premise that there is more to communion eschatologically than the mores of communion ecclesiology state or suggest.

After a helpful introduction, MacDougall's detailed examination begins in the second chapter by engaging with ecclesiology in the Roman Catholic, Orthodox, and Anglican traditions, and the ecumenical dialogues connected to the World Council of Churches, respectively. MacDougall then engages briefly with the background critiques of communion ecclesiology before more comprehensively outlining its principal critiques: eschatologically; relationally; and practically (pp. 33–58). What is needed, MacDougall maintains, is an ecclesiology that engages with churches as they are as they await the "ideal perfection of community [which] … can only occur eschatologically" (p. 60). Thus, the realised eschatologies of communion ecclesiologies and their attendant practical and relational problems require the counterbalance of an anticipatory eschatology.

The third and fourth chapters offer two representative cases of communion ecclesiology: firstly, an Orthodox perspective (Church Beyond the World: John Zizoulas) and, secondly, an Anglican, Radical Orthodox scholar (Church Over Against the World: John Milbank). In the former, MacDougall argues convincingly that Zizioulas' "theology of the future and the principal ecclesial practice [the eucharist] that flows from it are most accurately characterized as reflecting a realized eschatology" (p. 97). The eucharist for Zizioulas is *the* protological and eschatological practice which 'humanises' its participants bringing them into "communion with the Godhead". The world's hostility towards the eucharistic reality of the church, accordingly, makes it one-step-removed from this communion and personhood. Consequently, Zizioulas' church is "a reality beyond the world" (p. 100). In the latter, MacDougall argues that, while Milbank is no ecclesiologist, his "ecclesiology is the very summit of his theology" (p. 117). Augustinian Neoplatonism leads to Milbank transposing the church-secular duality onto the *Civitas Dei* and *Civitas terrena* with each city ordered towards an ontology of peace or violence respectively (p. 113). This modern 'Manichean' framing of reality leads to the church being "over *against* the world" (pp. 101-40). The church, therefore, possesses a distinctive logic that is oriented towards truth and peace. It is only through participation in ecclesial communion that we can participate in God. MacDougall claims that the "church is the spatio-temporal site of … multifaceted participation" because its "interlocking modes of bodily and spiritual participation—in being and receiving the body of Christ in the ontological, social, and eucharist senses—effect ecclesial communion" and, by extension, communion with God (p. 140). Full communion then leads back to Eden rather than to the launch of the New Jerusalem (p. 126). Therefore, MacDougall fairly faults Milbank's

eschatology with being "ecclesiocentric, somewhat Johannine, overly realized, and restorationist in its strong emphasis on repristinization and the re-establishment of the prelapsarian order" (p. 140).

In the next chapter, (Church in the World: An Eschatological Imagination for Christian Communities), MacDougall engages in more constructive work that improves on Milbank's and Zizioulas' communion ecclesiologies. He sketches out an "eschatological imagination that stresses the balance of and the tension between the eschatological already and not yet" with a wider conception of communion (p. 141). The theological role of this imagination is "making the absent present, discerning ultimate meaning, envisioning new life, and generating hope" (p. 149). MacDougall then references Brian D. Robinette's *Grammars of Resurrection* to create seven "principles" to help "condition a coherent and responsible eschatological imagination" (p. 149). He delineates his communion theology through unpacking four paradoxical statements that outline the continuities and discontinuities of his eschatological imagination (pp. 149-59). The final section establishes two staples of such an imagination: a "commitment to a real future based on divine promise and an already-not yet structure" (p. 159). These statements keep in check churches' triumphalism as they actively anticipate the fulfilment of communion eschatologically.

In chapter 6 (Church for the World (Part I): Re-Imagining Eschatological Ecclesiology) the argument moves to conceptualising how the church can be *for* the world. MacDougall rejects a conflation of church and kingdom, contending instead that the church's vocation for the world is as "the anticipation of the *basileia*" (p. 182). The church is tasked with being both a minister to the world in its present pain and a prophet who points towards God's promised future (p. 183). The church is for the world because God's "promise is always a promise *for* the world." (p. 182). Accordingly, there is "one promise … and the one world … is the field of its operation and appearance" (p. 182). God's holistic reconciliation of *the world* brings about "an intersubjective relational excess"; a "four-fold communion … between humanity and God, among human beings, within human beings, and between humanity and the rest of creation" (p. 177). In contrast to the eschatological imaginations of communion ecclesiologies whose "[conceptions] of communion [are], commonly, … relatively abstract, somewhat Platonic, often ahistorical, a bit immaterial, essentially dualistic, limited to an elect, contemplative, and generally institutional, hierarchical, and liturgical, [MacDougall's imagination of] the coming realization of the four-fold communion of reconciliation … leads to an imagination of communion that is more concrete, historically contextualized, embodied, tensive, active, and cosmic" (p. 177). His communion ecclesiology is equipped with an eschatological imagination informed by "five qualitative 'marks': tensiveness, openness, risk, trust, and hope" (p. 186).

In the corresponding chapter, (Church for the World (Part II): Practicing Eschatological Ecclesiology), MacDougall integrates the conceptual and the practical. Ecclesial hope for him is a practice that is "both propositional and dispositional rather than emotional or conditional" (p. 213) a*nd* that is also a gift that "springs from a lived experience of the power of God at work in Christian community through the presence of the Holy Spirit in corporate worship and worldly service" (p. 214). The first point highlights that a theology of practice contains two insights: that theology is itself a practice and that, in practice, theology is informed by and informs Christians' practices. In short, a theological imagination is both "practice-shaped and practice-shaping" (p. 216). MacDougall then reviews various practices surveyed by

practical theologians affiliated with the Bass-Dykstra 'school'. Through probing these practices, he identifies an implicit eschatological imagination that leads him to conclude that worship offers a performative epistemology by which we simultaneously engage in meaningful worship and in meaning-making about worship (p. 224). These practices are performed through an eschatological imagination that *both* "maintains that the *basileia* is simultaneously present (as inaugurated) and coming (as anticipated)" *and* that communion within it includes "the whole world as the site and recipient of eschatological transformation" (p. 235). This expansive understanding of *basileia* results in not only "Christian practice [becoming] coextensive with discipleship" (p. 236) but also that "Christian discipleship cannot be limited to churchly practices" (p. 242). This paradox highlights that the practices Christians engage in range from the sacramental and sacrosanct to the quotidian and common. MacDougall innovates this idea through adopting from Benjamin Conner a missional ecclesiology that encompasses both *ad intra* and *ad extra* dimensions (p. 243). The church's faithful presence while actively awaiting God's eschatological promise requires, an imagination that rejects theological "closure [concerning] the form of an eschatological ecclesiology and practice". Favouring the sketchy knowledge of "the *kind* of reality the *basileia* signifies" over a blueprint ecclesiology that "[grasps for] its ultimate *form*" (p. 249). Thus, "[c]ommunion is more than what most ecclesiologies of communion offer and what church is and does is more than what those ecclesiologies would have of it" (p. 253).

MacDougall is to be commended for his high calibre contribution to Bloomsbury T&T Clark's *Ecclesiological Investigations* series. His monograph engages exhaustively and effortlessly with significant theologians such as Zizioulas, Milbank, Moltmann, and Pannenberg to consolidate and coordinate communion ecclesiology and eschatology. However, his work has a relative dearth of Christology, namely Christ's session. This reticence may be because of MacDougall's reservations towards the conceptions of lordship, kingdom, and reign (p. 12). I recognise that a resurrection grammar is core to his argument, as "[t]he foundational basis for the eschatological analogy has to be the bodily resurrection of Jesus Christ, the eschatological event *par excellence*" because "[t]he resurrection is the only solid basis for an analogy that allows us to advance a preliminary imaginative theological claim about the ultimate end of present reality" (pp. 146–47, italics original). He later adds that "[t]he resurrection stands as God's pledge to fulfil the divine promise to be in communion with creation, and thereby to transform, reconcile, and preserve it in goodness eternally" (p. 165). MacDougall is clear that his four-fold communion theology is reliant on God becoming "all in all" (1 Cor 15:20–28) and God's reconciliation of all things (Col 1:15–20). In spite of referencing these Christocentric passages, Christ is mentioned sparingly (pp. 157–58). Later, he claims that "[t]he hope of Christian people, individually and collectively, is instantiated in the practical life of discipleship, the acts of reconciliation and communion through which Jesus' own *basileia* practice is announced and continued. ... It may not be too much to say that, imagined properly, the practice of being church—of gathering as disciples—is itself the richest expression of eschatological hope there is" (p. 246). This statement alongside comments about the church being "[compelled] to go deeper into the world to continue the mission of the reconciliation of all things that Jesus inaugurated" (p. 251) risks diminishing Christ's ongoing mediatory work as creation's ascended high priest whilst demanding the shortfall from the militant church. Therefore,

although MacDougall has admirably added more to communion, he appears to have neglected the eschatological 'God-man's' person and work.

Scott W. Sunquist. *Explorations in Asian Christianity: History, Theology, and Mission.* (336 pp.) Downers Grove: IVP Academic, 2017. (336 pp.) ISBN: 9780830851003

Daniel J. Cameron
Chicago, USA

Scott W. Sunquist currently serves as the president of Gordon Conwell Theological Seminary. He served previously as professor and dean at the School of Intercultural Studies at Fuller Theological Seminary and has numerous publications in Asian Christianity, missiology, and global Christianity. In the fifth volume of the *Missiological Engagements* series from InterVarsity Press sits Sunquist's volume entitled *Explorations in Asian Christianity.* Sunquist's book began as a series of lectures, book chapters, and journal articles. It is structured in four parts (Asia surveys, History, Missiology, Education) serving the overall goal in attempting to "better understand Asian Christianity" (p. 2).

In part one, entitled "Asia," Sunquist seeks to give us a taste of Asian Christianity throughout history and of the particularly Asian flavor of global Christianity. As Christianity grew and developed in Asia through the rise of Islam, European and Asian colonialism, and the fall of the Japanese and European imperialism "it continues to be a minority religion" (p. 22). As Christianity developed in Asia, it was "less ordered and more diverse" than Christianity was in the Roman Empire (p. 35). In fact, many of the theologians exiled by the councils in the West found acceptance in the East where they held their own councils. Often "called to reorganize the church after persecution: little theological discussion ensued" (p. 36). The pragmatic character of Christianity in Asia permeated the earliest movements of ecumenism in Asia too as they "were more of a pragmatic than a theological commitment" (p. 41). This held true as the ecumenical movement developed from a desire to see a "greater organic and conciliar unity" evolve into "a movement to cooperate in the social, cultural, and political spheres" (p. 48). In the midst of all of this, Protestant Christianity found its foothold through British East India Company, Dutch United East India Company, and the Danish East India Company. While these companies had business motivations in mind they certainly opened the door for Protestant missionaries. This led to several early missionary movements in Asia which "set patterns and established values that have continued to be characteristic of Asian evangelicalism" (p. 53).

In part two, entitled "History," Sunquist seeks to rethink "how we study history" and therefore "how we can or should view Christianity as a global movement" (p. 4). This section opens with a critique of recent Christian historiography arguing that research concerning historical Christianity has been defined by "confessional and geographic factors" (p. 94). He argues for an approach that focuses on the development of a movement in relation to the crucified Jesus rather than the growth of an institution. The record of historical Christianity is understood as the mission of God in relation to cruciformity which, he argues,