research on the use of sacred texts in moral injury treatment from scholars of religion and pastoral theologians, and reflective practice from caregivers and military personnel themselves.

John M. G. Barclay, *Paul and the Power of Grace*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2020. (xviii + 184) [ISBN 9780802874610]

Jonathan R. Robinson

John Barclay is Lightfoot Professor of Divinity at Durham University. He is an authority on the Second-Temple Jewish Background of the New Testament and possibly the most widely respected Pauline scholar of the current time after his book, *Paul and the Gift* (Eerdmans, 2015). That last work is probably the most important book in Pauline studies since E. P Sanders' *Paul and Palestinian Judaism* (Fortress, 1977), although time is yet to tell if it will have such an enduring impact. *Paul and the Gift* is an imposing and detailed tome of nearly 700 pages and designed to engage numerous complex scholarly debates. This more recent work, *Paul and the Power of Grace*, is a much-condensed and more accessible version of the earlier book, but with additional chapters responding to questions and concerns raised by respondents. It should be said at the outset, that this book is a model of clarity, accessibility, scholarly care, and economy. It absolutely succeeds in its intention and is highly readable.

Chapters 1-9 of *Paul and the Power of Grace* contain a precis of the argument of *Paul and the Gift*. The first two chapters discuss the anthropology of and possible implications of the idea of gift, a concept found throughout human societies. Barclay clearly explicates six different ways in which gift/grace could be understood to be "perfected." The concept of gift may reach perfection in some combination of or emphasis on superabundance, singularity, priority, incongruity, efficacy, and non-circularity (pp.13-16). Barclay argues that a failure to clarify these different possible approaches to gift has fueled many theological and exegetical disagreements (p. 17). He rightly observes that non-circularity of gift is the most widespread present-day conception of a perfect gift, that is, one with no response expected or required. However, as he argues in the next chapter, this view of gift is simply not apparent in ancient texts. Therefore, reading Paul as if he has a modern conception of gift may considerably mislead the interpreter.

The third chapter discusses four different Second Temple texts, each of which illustrates a different understanding of gift at work in the Jewish environment. The Wisdom of Solomon "expresses an emphatic theology of grace" marked by priority (God gives first) and superabundance (God gives abundantly) but not by incongruity, because God only gives to the worthy (p. 31). Philo of Alexandria "thinks that God's gifts are singular, abundant, and prior" but not undeserved, or incongruous (p. 32). The Hodayot (hymns) of Qumran give "probably the most negative picture of the human condition in Jewish literature of the time." God brings the elect into an undeserved righteousness and destiny despite their initial worthlessness, and thus grace is perfected in incongruity (pp. 33-4). His final example is the dialogue from 4 Ezra between Ezra and the angel Uriel. While Ezra pleads for incongruous grace, mercy given to the unrighteous, for Uriel this would "compromise justice" and is "ultimately unsatisfactory as a view of the world" (p. 36).

Barclay thus effectively demonstrates the need for a nuanced approach to Jewish thought about gift and grace. Early Jews were diverse in the way they perfected grace, and so when reading Paul, in context as a Jew, one particular model of grace cannot be assumed.

Chapters 4-6 are structured as a commentary on grace in Galatians. Arguing that the letter is a response to the influence of Messianic-Jews on the gentile congregation in Galatia, in particular, their insistence on circumcision both in regard to Mosaic law and to the patriarchal narratives of Abraham, Barclay demonstrates how Paul's theological response to each aspect of this controversy is set in the language of "gift" (pp.40-41). One of the key exegetical moves Barclay makes is his interpretation of the verb *dikaioō,* usually translated justify, as not describing a change in condition but, in view of its normal meaning in Greek, as describing a judgement of worth (p.48). Thus, worth does not come through being circumcised but is a result of the gift of Christ, a gift that is effective not because of the worth of the recipient, but because of the incongruous worth of the gift. In light of this gift, all other possible factors of worth, the law of Moses, gender, race, or legal status as slave or free (cf. Gal 3:15) are radically relativized and only have value in as far as they contribute to the purposes of Christ (p50). He concludes that "this unconditioned gift, given in Christ, cannot be mapped onto prior configurations of worth, it subverts old cultural norms, it refounds individual subjectivity, it justifies new patterns of mission, it reconfigures history, it retunes the voice of scripture, and it creates new communities on the landscape of the Roman Empire" (p. 73).

In a similar vein, chapters 7-9 provide a commentary on Romans. Barclay traces several ways that Paul's thought has developed from the letter to the Galatians. Whereas in Galatians God's gift is given "irrespective of worth," in Romans Paul articulates that it is given "in the absence of worth" (p. 76). In addition to this amplification of the incongruity of God's grace, Barclay also highlights other developments, including the "efficacy" and "superabundance" of God's grace in Romans (p. 76). As a result, "God's incongruous grace creates congruity" (p. 81). That is, the grace of God, while "unconditioned" (given without regard to worth) is not "unconditional," it has an expected outcome in the transformation of the receiver (p. 87). Importantly, "What grace conveys is not a thing but a person" (p. 90) this gift generates a new relationship, which generates an obligation to act out the new life given through participation in Christ (p. 93). Importantly, even the ability to live this new life and to trust in Christ is itself part of the gift of Christ. In chapter 9, Barclay examines Romans 9-11 and shows that these difficult chapters are united by a "consistent narrative pattern," that is, "the incongruity of divine election, the absence of fit between divine mercy and the worth of its recipients" (p112).

For those familiar with *Paul and the Gift*, these chapters will contain little new. However, my short summary here cannot do justice to just how scintillating and nuanced Barclay's exegesis is, even in condensed form. He compresses the insights from a much larger work into these chapters, and so these commentaries are exceedingly rich. Whilst cleaving strictly to the theme of grace, Barclay nonetheless touches on many other issues of import with economy and skill. While their purpose is to convey the thesis of the book regarding the central place of the incongruous, unconditioned, but not unconditional grace of

God in Paul's thought, they could also serve a as useful commentary for preaching or study. Barclay also displays a talent for pithy and arresting phrases, and where the subject matter reoccurs, he seems to work hard, and successfully so, to couch it in fresh language and to keep the reader's attention and imagination engaged.

The remaining chapters move to more original material, developing the argument beyond the original scope of *Paul and the Gift*. In chapter 10, Barclay seeks to demonstrate how Paul's conception of God's grace functions as "the grammar of his theology" (p. 114) elsewhere in the undisputed Pauline letters. He argues that, despite the change in terminology, in the Corinthian correspondence and Philippians, the underlying pattern of Paul's theology is "recognizably the same" as that of Galatians and Romans (p. 119). In the Corinthian correspondence, incongruous grace is reflected in incongruous power in weakness (cf. 1 Cor 1:18-23; 2 Cor 13:4) and "undermines the human capital in which believers take confidence" so that they can only trust in the gift of Christ (p.119). In the letter to the Philippians, "Christ participates in the human condition all the way to death, in order that others may participate in his condition, all the way to eternal life," and "this reconstituted self is and always will be the product of a gift" (p.123).

Chapter 11 expands the discussion by outlining some ethical implications of Paul's theology of grace within Pauline church communities. These ethical practices are a "return-gift to God" but also a "forward transfer of grace" whereby others benefit from what God has given us (p. 125). This can be seen in Paul's discussion of the use of individual "gifts" in the body of Christ for the sake of the community (1 Cor 12; Rom 12; cf. Eph 4; p.126) as well as in the honour given to those who conventional society would consider of lesser worth (p. 128). In the "one another" language found in Paul's letters, Barclay argues we see an ideal of a reciprocal support network operating within Christians communities, which function to both support the community and also to enable the community to give back to God who is the source of that gift-dynamic" (p. 132). And in the collection gift for Jerusalem, a "circle" of grace is exposed as grace comes first from God in Christ, is at work "through and among believers," and returns to God in thanksgiving (2 Cor 9:12-15; p. 133).

Chapter 12 helps situate Barclay's thesis in regard to other perspectives on Paul: Protestant, Catholic, the New Perspective on Paul, and the Paul within Judaism School. This chapter is particularly helpful for those who are not professional Pauline scholars. His summaries of the other approaches are balanced and sympathetic, rather than agonistic. Barclay, rightly in my view, presents his thesis as a mediating way, with commonalities and constructive critique for all the schools mentioned. Perhaps one other important school of thought missing from the discussion would be the Apocalyptic Paul perspective. This is treated in a footnote that refers the reader to his discussion in *Paul and the Gift* (fn.5 p. 139). You cannot cover everything in a book this size, but given the influence of J. Louis Martyn and others on the theological reception of Paul (especially among Barthians), this would have been helpful to include. Notwithstanding, this chapter demonstrates why Barclay has become such a significant figure in Pauline studies. In his work, he appears to have listened to and learned from each school of thought and critiques them without disregarding or negating their contribution.

The final chapter reflects on how Paul's vision of grace, as described by Barclay, might connect with contemporary culture and church. Here Barclay offers three brief sketches of "theological interpretation" that takes inspiration from Paul's letters "in their historical context" but also utilize "a necessary freedom to rethink his theology for new contexts" (p. 151). He argues that Paul's theology of grace is "a rich resource for Christians in challenging racism, gender prejudice, and all forms of negative stereotype" (p. 152). He argues that the "indiscriminate grace of God in Christ" is a superior foundation for human rights than the *Imago Dei,* the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights,* or the *American Declaration of Independence* (pp. 153-4). He also suggests Paul's theology of grace could address the crisis of self-worth, mental health and self-esteem in Western culture (p. 154). It is not just a matter of theoretically locating our self-worth in the unconditioned love of God, but also enacting Paul's "social vision of community in which each person honors and affirms the other" (p. 155). Finally, he argues that our Western perfection of gift as non-circular has rendered our approach to charity as "patronizing, demeaning and disempowering" (p. 157). Against this he argues Paul's ethic of "reciprocity and interdependency" (p. 157) has currency both inside and outside of church situations: "everyone has something to give to others, and one should expect to give not *to* the poor but *with* them" (p. 158, emphasis original). He concludes that "one of Paul's greatest contributions to our contemporary world must be his theology of grace" (p. 159).

While Pauline scholars will still need to refer to *Paul and the Gift* for their work, for most others *Paul and the Power of Grace* is an excellent volume that will be a wonderful resource for undergraduate study, sermon preparation, theological engagement with Paul, and personal interest. It is highly recommended.

Willie James Jennings, *After Whiteness: An Education in Belonging*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2020. (165 pp.) [ISBN: 9780802878441]

A. D. Clark-Howard

Willie Jennings has begun to solidify his legacy as one of the most significant and important prophetic voices in the theological guild, examining the entanglements of race, colonialism, Christian theology, and its twenty-first-century performances. His latest text, *After Whiteness*—part treatise, part memoir, part poetry—both recapitulates and condenses some of his previous work on the relationship of the theological academy and the modern racial condition entrenched by centuries of European colonialism, while also, albeit tentatively, offering a more constructive and concrete vision for theological education. Though it is always difficult to make such claims so close to any historical moment, this text, if taken seriously, promises to upend and remake theological education into the future. It demands a wide readership across all spectrums and subdisciplines within the theological academy and by all theological educators.

Jennings' main claim in the text is that "the formation that attends theological education and, more broadly, Western education is troubled—in fact, deeply distorted" (p. 5). Formation lies at the heart of the educational exercise; as Jennings' neatly surmises: "Education and theological education kill the lie that people don't change" (p. 5). Yet the change wrought by much theological education in the West is