The final chapter reflects on how Paul's vision of grace, as described by Barclay, might connect with contemporary culture and church. Here Barclay offers three brief sketches of "theological interpretation" that takes inspiration from Paul's letters "in their historical context" but also utilize "a necessary freedom to rethink his theology for new contexts" (p. 151). He argues that Paul's theology of grace is "a rich resource for Christians in challenging racism, gender prejudice, and all forms of negative stereotype" (p. 152). He argues that the "indiscriminate grace of God in Christ" is a superior foundation for human rights than the *Imago Dei,* the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights,* or the *American Declaration of Independence* (pp. 153-4). He also suggests Paul's theology of grace could address the crisis of self-worth, mental health and self-esteem in Western culture (p. 154). It is not just a matter of theoretically locating our self-worth in the unconditioned love of God, but also enacting Paul's "social vision of community in which each person honors and affirms the other" (p. 155). Finally, he argues that our Western perfection of gift as non-circular has rendered our approach to charity as "patronizing, demeaning and disempowering" (p. 157). Against this he argues Paul's ethic of "reciprocity and interdependency" (p. 157) has currency both inside and outside of church situations: "everyone has something to give to others, and one should expect to give not *to* the poor but *with* them" (p. 158, emphasis original). He concludes that "one of Paul's greatest contributions to our contemporary world must be his theology of grace" (p. 159).

While Pauline scholars will still need to refer to *Paul and the Gift* for their work, for most others *Paul and the Power of Grace* is an excellent volume that will be a wonderful resource for undergraduate study, sermon preparation, theological engagement with Paul, and personal interest. It is highly recommended.

Willie James Jennings, *After Whiteness: An Education in Belonging*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2020. (165 pp.) [ISBN: 9780802878441]

A. D. Clark-Howard

Willie Jennings has begun to solidify his legacy as one of the most significant and important prophetic voices in the theological guild, examining the entanglements of race, colonialism, Christian theology, and its twenty-first-century performances. His latest text, *After Whiteness*—part treatise, part memoir, part poetry—both recapitulates and condenses some of his previous work on the relationship of the theological academy and the modern racial condition entrenched by centuries of European colonialism, while also, albeit tentatively, offering a more constructive and concrete vision for theological education. Though it is always difficult to make such claims so close to any historical moment, this text, if taken seriously, promises to upend and remake theological education into the future. It demands a wide readership across all spectrums and subdisciplines within the theological academy and by all theological educators.

Jennings' main claim in the text is that "the formation that attends theological education and, more broadly, Western education is troubled—in fact, deeply distorted" (p. 5). Formation lies at the heart of the educational exercise; as Jennings' neatly surmises: "Education and theological education kill the lie that people don't change" (p. 5). Yet the change wrought by much theological education in the West is

deformed. In a rather sweeping categorisation in terms of intersectionality, Jennings argues that the formative which "propels the curricular, pedagogical, and formational energies of Western education, and especially theological education" is that of "a white self-sufficient man, his self-sufficiency defined by possession, control, and mastery" (p. 6). White, self-sufficient masculinity makes up the method, mode, and end of formation in the theological academy, a colonial *telos* aimed towards isolation, mastery, and control with deep roots in the history of Western Christianity and European imperialism. Jennings draws an analysis of the formational power of white self-sufficient masculinity in contrast with an image of Jesus amidst the crowds; diverse people brought together to dwell within the body which Christ himself offers. Such a reorientation in theological education is an orientation toward love and belonging, a bold vision of a thick life together characterised by the formation of "erotic souls" drawn into authentic connection with one another. "Theological education must capture its central work—to form us in the art of cultivating belonging" (p. 10).

The book is structured in five chapters, a prologue and brief epilogue. The prologue ("Secrets") introduces the text, provides definitions of critical terms utilised by Jennings, and plunges the reader into the mix of personal storytelling, poetry, and decolonial analysis, which is to follow. Chapter one ("Fragments") describes the way in which knowledge and skill is detached and rearranged towards the colonial ends of mastery and control in the intellectual instincts of Western theology. Such a model of arranging fragments is a way to detach from and control the other, as Jennings writes, "born of a tragic history of Christians who came not to learn anything from indigenous peoples but only to instruct them, and to exorcize and eradicate anything and everything that seemed strange and therefore anti-Christian" (p. 37). Chapter two ("Designs") examines the "form of attention cultivated through brutality," a design of intellectual life that should instead be met through affection and desire (p. 59). Intellectual attention drawn around the cultural aesthetic of whiteness resists the gathering of diverse peoples around Jesus, God enfleshed whose life is given for many. Chapter three ("Buildings") explores institutionalism and leadership, both, in Jennings' analysis, descendants of the plantation structure of slave and master. Leadership in the guild and in the church is judged by its cold bravado, an ability to "control the space and master the small worlds" (p. 86). Building, like education, is a gift from God, but entangled with white masculinity, it is a building toward death. Chapter four ("Motions") is more constructive. Jennings sketches out three areas in which a new image of formation and theological education can be imagined: "an assimilation, an inwardness, and a revolution that help us form an erotic soul," a theological culture formed towards communion (p. 134). Colonial designs of whiteness, control, and destruction can be replaced by practices of mutual exchange, contemplation, and eschatological renewal. Chapter five ("Eros") solidifies this new picture of theological education. Communion is the goal of theological education, a communion thwarted by whiteness. Nonetheless, such an image offers the theological academy an exciting, though uncharted, future.

Jennings' text is rich with personal insight and keen observation from his own experiences working as dean at Duke Divinity School. As his previous work has suggested, the problems late modernity poses

for theology of intellectual fragmentation and *passé* exclusivist truth claims are only a (possibly inconsequential) slice of the whole picture. Pressing deeper into the issues of our current cultural moment, especially from the underside of history, reveals a wider, more profound, centuries-long endeavour of conquest and power in the formation of race, whiteness, and coloniality within the ongoing legacies of European empires. Such legacies formulate and shape the way theological education exists today, pressing all peoples into a mould formed at the site of the colonial project and its fusion with Christianity. A "pedagogy of the plantation" functions as the main educational and formational reflex of theological education in the West, modelled off the mastery of the racial paterfamilias of colonial history (p. 82). One's positionality in reading these histories and their modern manifestations will account for its experience. For readers of colour, many stories recounted by Jennings will no doubt feel familiar and easily identifiable. For myself, however, as a white scholar in theology, it is an indispensable demonstration that while the old hegemonies may sometimes seem fragile, they are nonetheless thoroughly entrenched within our institutional and pedagogical structures.

Part of Jennings' project can also be understood as a reminder to the theological academy of the voices it has left behind in the past. In the prologue, Jennings references a text lost (or, rather, ignored) to history on Christian feminism and theological education as an important inspiration for his own. Produced in the 1980s by the Mud Flower Collective, a group of female and ethnically diverse scholars working in religious and theological education, *God's Fierce Whimsy* reflects in their own contexts on many of the poignant issues of race and gender Jennings raises today. (I am grateful to my colleague Jaimee van Gemerden who drew my attention to the Mud Flower Collective, and their influence over *After Whiteness*, and is seeking to explore their collective methodology for theological education and research today.) Furthermore, the title *After Whiteness* references Alasdair MacIntyre's influential *After Virtue*, indicative of Jennings' intended scope and critique. The implicit message of *After Whiteness* might be understood as thus: current diagnoses of the issues befalling theological education, and theological study more generally, have been looking in the wrong place. The main questions to be asking—questions which attend to the destructive effects of modern colonialism's impact on Christian intellectual discourse and pedagogy—are obfuscated by the theological guild's ongoing polemic against late modernity and its various splintering of religion, ontology, and morality, etc. Instead, it is the devastating performative effects of whiteness joined to Christian formation which lies at the heart of many of our deepest problems.

The mix of memoir, study, and poetry is both enigmatic and provocative. The book is also short, just over 150 pages in a small book format. Yet, a detailed investigation of the relationship between Christian theology, race, and European colonialism is not Jennings' purpose in writing here, and indeed one ought to seek out Jennings' magisterial and lengthier *The Christian Imagination: Theology and the Origins of Race* for such a project. However, the rejection of more typical forms of analytical writing and detail here seem to be part of the point. *After Whiteness* inhabits, in its very form and function, the type of decolonial theological discourse it seeks to explore. It is a plea to those of us who inhabit white, masculine positionalities to move towards the other and enter the destabilising process of encountering, in love, that

which is foreign—a project that, at least in Jennings' mind, invites an extravagance of language and form in writing. Such a process offers redemption, "to imagine new conversations that open up a shared exploration into the desire for communion that is intended to vivify theological education" (p. 157). Such practice is a "practice aimed at eternity," one that longs for the beauty and multiplicity of God's own eschaton (p. 157). Thus, there is something deeply pastoral in the wisdom and experiences Jennings offers as he reflects over his career.

After Whiteness is quite simply a ground-breaking text. While not a radical departure or invention from Jennings' earlier work, it condenses and applies much of his previous work on theology, race, and colonialism into a short format, accessible, and thoroughly disturbing *tour de force*. While, as I have already mentioned, it deserves to be read alongside Jennings' lengthier *Christian Imagination*, it is also sharper in focus than his previous *opus* and rid of the last vestiges of any sort of post-racial optimism present within the previous book's Obama context. There is no-one involved in theological education today—scholars, students, administrators, and so on—who should not read *After Whiteness* and reflect on its urgent message. Though readable in an afternoon, it invites meditative attention and multiple re-readings. Jennings' latest book is a profound, haunting examination of theological education as it is and yet theological education as it could be.

Viorel Coman, *Dumitru Stăniloae's Trinitarian Ecclesiology: Orthodoxy and the Filioque*. (London: Lexington/Fortress Academic, 2019. (310 pp.) [ISBN 9781978703780]

Jordan Jones

Viorel Coman's *Dumitru Stăniloae's Trinitarian Ecclesiology: Orthodoxy and the Filioque* consists of six chapters with the goal of demonstrating Stăniloae's relevance for Trinitarian theology for the debates about the *filioque* and the broader practical implications for the ecclesiology of Western and Eastern Trinitarian theologies. "The monograph," Coman reveals, "[gives] priority to Stăniloae's ecclesiological synthesis between Christology and pneumatology" (p. 263). With the first chapter giving necessary background information to help contextualise the Orthodox Church and Stăniloae, including his influence on and the influence on him of the Neo-patristic movement, Western theology, and Trinitarian theology.

Chapter 2 is less bibliographical in its overview of "Stăniloae's Early Approach (1964-1978) to the *Filioque*." In it, Coman profitably appropriates Kallistos Ware's labels of "hawks" and "doves" to differentiate those scholars who perceived the *filioque* to have severe repercussions on Western theology, namely in ecclesiology, and those who saw the debate as insignificant and speculative (p. 25). After analysing the hawks and doves of the East and the West, respectively, Coman explores Stăniloae's engagement with the *filioque*. After initially indicating that Stăniloae's scholarship was silent on the topic for over 20 years until 1964, Coman explores how Stăniloae's subsequent reaction to the *filioque* was a reflection of his Orthodox influences, primarily Photius, the three Byzantine theologians—Gregory II of Cyprus, Gregory